

Latecomer State Formation

Sebastián Mazzuca
Johns Hopkins University

Yale University Press, 2021

Appendix - Expanded Bibliography

This is an updated version of the bibliographic essay that was available on my Google Scholar page until September 20, 2022. The prior version needed improvement—a major deficit was that some parts were not written in English, and the citation style was not uniform. This version can be found here: <https://sebastianmazzuca.com/books-2/> (right below the book cover). Throughout, it refers to the book *Latecomer State Formation* as *LSF*.

Preface

This bibliographic essay discusses mostly works in history, but the intended audience is fellow political scientists and political economists, not historians.

The key theoretical messages for historians are stated in the book itself. I hope that Latin American historians might find useful *LSF*'s new perspective on how to re-read economic and political processes that their profession has documented quite well. The new perspective centers on a precise notion of **state formation**, and the theory that state formation is a **critical juncture** that, depending on how it is solved, sends countries along different developmental trajectories. In other words, I used history books as sources of evidence about processes, facts and motivations that *LSF* re-connects and re-organizes under a new political economy theory of long-run development. Yet, when I found gaps in the documentation, I covered them with primary sources that are identified in the book.

The goal of this essay is to give political scientists four types of source to complement the book: 1) works that provide **further evidence** for *LSF*'s theoretical interpretation of Latin America's political development over the course of the 19th century; 2) works that provide **additional context** to the several passages in which *LSF* relies on its own primary sources, especially those where I document and reconstruct political motivations of the key players of state formation in Argentina, Brazil, Colombia, Mexico, and Uruguay; 3) works that provide a **deeper analysis and documentation** of a specific topic that, due to space limitations, was impossible to cover in *LSF*; and 4) works that may seem to provide **alternative explanations**, for which I offer brief criticism and/or explain how they are, after re-analysis, compatible with *LSF*'s theory.

Chapter 2

Independence and State Failure

This chapter makes two contributions. First, it re-characterizes the post-Independence period as a case of **state failure** involving the fragmentation of the big political units of the colonial period into **mini sovereignties**. Second, it traces the roots of state failure to a dual challenge. On the one hand, the rise of **caudillismo** (warlordism in general, and caciquismo, gamonalismo or colonelismo, depending on regions)—due largely to improvised military mobilization for Independence. On the other, **economic stagnation**—mainly caused by material destruction during the wars of Independence and weakness of the export sector.

Whereas the notion of state failure is a conceptual innovation to re-interpret Latin American history between Independence and 1870, warlordism and economic stagnation (the causes of state failure) have been widely documented and analyzed by historians.

For the purposes of the book, a focus on the **state** is analytically superior to two other big concepts that usually structure historiographic narratives of 19th-century Latin America: the **nation** and the **republic**.

Most histories of individual countries in Latin America or of the region as a whole frame the post-Independence period as a process of **nation building**, as seen in dozens of scholarly works with titles like “Inventing the Nation,” “The Struggle for Nationhood in Peru,” or “A National Project for the Argentine Desert.” In the context of Latin America, the process of nation building occurred *after* that of state formation. In fact, nation-building as a project could only be launched once the rudiments of a consolidated territory ruled with the support of an overwhelming army were in place, i.e., after a state was formed. Hence, many of the conflicts and challenges that the literature has recurrently seen as affecting the nation can more usefully be reinterpreted as symptoms of deeper problems of state failure. The first national histories of most Latin American countries—which still inform the narrative of high-school textbooks—have been thoroughly criticized and revised by professional historians since the late mid-20th century. Yet, a focus on the nation still dominates many of the most sophisticated historical works (Halperin Donghi 1995; Knight 1994; Mallon 1995; Zoraida Vázquez 1999; Lynch 2001; Annino and Guerra 2003).

In the 1990s, after decades of nation-centered political histories of the 19th century, several scholars produced a “republican turn” and began to study phenomena that political scientists associate with the **regime**: elections, public opinion, rules of citizenship. A focus on the state is superior for the analytical purposes of the book because, as I have discussed elsewhere (Mazucca 2017), one cannot speak of a regime in a context where the very state is missing. “No state, no regime,” so to speak. The focus on the state advanced in *LSF* complements the work on post-Independence political regimes (Safford 1992; Aguilar y Rojas 2002; Posada-Carbó 2016; Sábato 2018). Some works, still abstracting from issue of state formation, combine the agenda on nations and the agenda on elections (Annino 1995; Sanders 2014).

Although not framed in terms of state failure, several historians have documented the fragmentation of the five large political units of the colonial period into dozens of **mini sovereignties** in the first half century of independent life. This process has been deeply buried by romantic mythologies according to which all Latin American nations (from Mexico to

Argentina) pre-existed the independence period. Under colonial rule, the mythology claims, such nations were only waiting for the right moment to emerge. The mythology was irreversibly debunked by key studies documenting the rise of local forms of sovereignty, i.e., the factual political independence of territories that today are subnational units of larger countries. The best ones are Annino (1994), Bushnell (1999), Chiaramonte (1999), and Dym (2006) for Spanish America, and Barman (1994) for Brazil.

Many of the new mini sovereignties were led by **caudillos**. On caudillismo, the most comprehensive introductory approach is Lynch (1992). Hammil (1992: parts I and II) is selection of texts covering the full range of perspectives. On “caudillo finance,” which captures the interaction between fiscal bankruptcy and warlordism in this period of Latin American history, see Gootenberg (2014). Wolf and Hansen (1974) pioneered the structural-economic interpretation of warlordism in Latin America, which most historians consider untenable in its pure form. Halperín Donghi (1973) subsumes caudillismo under the broader phenomenon of the “ruralization of political power.” The best histories of caudillos are told at the national and sometimes local levels. See Krauze (2021) for Mexico, Deas (1973) for Colombia, Gilmore (1964) and Izard (1987) for Venezuela, Arze Aguirre (1979) for Bolivia, and Goldman and Salvatore (2005) for Argentina and Uruguay.

The best overall characterization of Latin America’s **economic stagnation** is provided by Halperín Donghi (1993: chs. 2-3), who introduced the notion of *Larga Espera* (Long Wait), a superlative expression synthesizing the economic stagnation of the region before 1850, and its deleterious effects on the chances of stabilizing any form of political order. Largely aligned with Halperín Donghi’s periodization, economic historians of Latin America have left no doubt about the scale and depth of the economic stagnation suffered by the region (Bulmer-Thomas 2003: ch. 2; Bértola and Ocampo 2015: ch. 2; Haber 1997; Prados De La Escosura 2006; Bates, Coatsworth, and Williamson 2007).

- Aguilar, José Antonio, and Rafael Rojas (eds.). 2002. *El Republicanismo en Hispanoamérica*. Mexico: Fondo de Cultura Económica.
- Annino, Antonio. 1994. "Soberanías en Lucha." In Annino, Antonio, Luis Castro Leiva, François-Xavier Guerra (eds.). *De los Imperios a las Naciones: Iberoamérica*. Zaragoza: Ibercaja: 269–92.
- Annino, Antonio, and François-Xavier Guerra (eds.). 2003. *Inventando la Nación: Iberoamérica. Siglo XIX*. Mexico: Fondo de Cultura Económica.
- Annino, Antonio, Luis Castro Leiva, François-Xavier Guerra (eds.). 1994. *De Los Imperios a Las Naciones: Iberoamérica*. Zaragoza: Ibercaja.
- Annino, Antonio (ed.). 1995. *Historia de las Elecciones en Iberoamérica, Siglo XIX: de la Formación del Espacio Político Nacional*. Mexico: Fondo de Cultura Económica.
- Barman, Roderick. 1994. *Brazil: the Forging of a Nation, 1798-1852*. Stanford: Stanford University Press.
- Bates, Robert H., John Henry Coatsworth, and Jeffrey Gale Williamson. 2007. "Lost Decades: Post independence Performance in Latin America and Africa." *The Journal of Economic History*, 67.4: 917-943.
- Bértola, Luis, and José Antonio Ocampo. 2015. *The Economic Development of Latin America Since Independence*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Bulmer-Thomas, Victor. 2003. *The Economic History of Latin America Since Independence*. New York: Cambridge University Press.
- Bulmer-Thomas, Victor, John Coatsworth, and Roberto Cortes-Conde (eds.). 2006. *The Cambridge Economic History of Latin America*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press
- Bushnell, David. 1999. "Unidad Política y Conflictos Regionales." In Zoraida Vázquez, Josefina. *La Construcción de las Naciones Latinoamericanas*. Madrid: UNESCO/Trotta: 63-84.
- Chiaromonte, José Carlos. 1999. "Estado y Poder Regional." In Zoraida Vázquez, Josefina. 1999. *La Construcción de las Naciones Latinoamericanas*. Madrid: UNESCO/Trotta: 145-196.
- Deas, Malcolm. 1973. "Algunas Notas sobre la Historia del Caciquismo en Colombia," *Revista de Occidente*, 127: 118-140
- Dym, Jordana. 2006. *From Sovereign Villages to National States: City, State, and Federation in Central America, 1759–1839*. Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press.
- Gilmore, Robert Louis 1964, *Caudillism and Militarism in Venezuela, 1810–1910*. Athens: Ohio University Press.
- Goldman, Noemí, and Ricardo Donato Salvatore. 2005. *Caudillismos Rioplatenses: Nuevas Miradas a un Viejo Problema*. Buenos Aires: Eudeba.
- Gootenberg, Paul Eliot. 2014. *Between Silver and Guano: Commercial Policy and the State in Postindependence Peru*. Princeton University Press.
- Haber, Stephen Henry (ed.). 1997. *How Latin America Fell Behind: Essays on the Economic Histories of Brazil and Mexico*. Stanford: Stanford University Press.
- Halperín Donghi, Tulio. 1973. *The Aftermath of Revolution in Latin America*. New York: Harper & Row.
- Halperín Donghi, Tulio. 1993. *The Contemporary History of Latin America*. Durham: Duke University Press.
- Halperín Donghi, Tulio. 1995. *Proyecto y Construcción de una Nación: Argentina, 1846-1880*. Buenos Aires: Ariel.
- Hamill, Hugh M. (ed.). 1992. *Caudillos: Dictators in Spanish America*. Norman: University of Oklahoma Press.
- Huber, Evelyne, and Frank Safford (eds.). 1995. *Agrarian Structure Political Power: Landlord and Peasant in the Making of Latin America*. Pittsburgh: University of Pittsburgh Press.

- Izard, Miquel. 1987. "Sin el Menor Arraigo ni Responsabilidad: Llaneros y Ganadería a Principios del Siglo XIX." *Boletín Americanista*, 37: 109-142
- Knight, Alan. 1994. "Peasants into Patriots: Thoughts on the Making of the Mexican Nation," *Mexican Studies/Estudios Mexicanos*, 10.1: 135-161
- Krauze, Enrique. 2021. *Siglo de Caudillos: Biografía Política de México (1810-1910)*. Mexico: Editorial Planeta.
- Lynch, John. 1992. *Caudillos in Spanish America 1800-1850*. New York: Clarendon Press of Oxford University Press.
- Lynch, John. 2001. *Latin America Between Colony and Nation: Selected Essays*. London: Macmillan.
- Mallon, Florencia E. 1995. *Peasant and Nation: the Making of postcolonial Mexico and Peru*. Berkeley: University of California Press.
- Mazzuca, Sebastián. 2017. "States, Regimes, and Other Structures of Rule." *APSA Comparative Democratization Newsletter*, 15.1: 6, 27-31.
- Posada-Carbó, Eduardo. 2000. "Electoral Juggling: A Comparative History of the Corruption of Suffrage in Latin America, 1830-1930." *Journal of Latin American Studies* 32.3: 611-644.
- Posada-Carbó, Eduardo (ed.). 2016. *Elections Before Democracy: the History of Elections in Europe and Latin America*. London: McMillan.
- Prados de la Escosura, Leandro. 2006. "The Economic Consequences of Independence in Latin America." In Victor Bulmer-Thomas, John Coatsworth, and Roberto Cortes-Conde (eds.), *The Cambridge Economic History of Latin America*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press: 461-504.
- Sabato, Hilda. 2018. *Republics of the New World: the Revolutionary Political Experiment in Nineteenth-century Latin America*. Princeton: Princeton University Press.
- Safford, Frank. 1974. "Bases of Political Alignment in Early Republican Spanish America." *New Approaches to Latin American History*. Austin: University of Texas Press.
- Safford, Frank. 1992. "The Problem of Political Order in Early Republican Spanish America." *Journal of Latin American Studies*, 24.1: 83-97.
- Sanders, James. 2014. *The Vanguard of the Atlantic World: Creating Modernity, Nation, and Democracy in Nineteenth-century Latin America*. Duke University Press.
- Wolf, Eric Robert, and Edward Charles Hansen. 1967. "Caudillo Politics: A Structural Analysis." *Comparative Studies in Society and History* 9.2: 168-179.
- Zoraida Vázquez, Josefina (ed.). 1999. *La Construcción de las Naciones Latinoamericanas*. Madrid: UNESCO/Trotta.

Chapter 3

The Triumph of Trade-led State Formation

From a descriptive perspective, the main contribution of this chapter is to re-characterize the second half of the 19th century in Latin America as a period of **state formation**, in contrast to the less precise characterizations of **oligarchic order** or **nation building** that are common in the historiography. From a causal perspective, the main contribution is to trace state formation in Latin America to a **boom in international trade**.

Historians documenting **state formation** in Latin America have done excellent work both at the level of an emerging national state, as well as at the local level--i.e., the mutation of a de facto local sovereignty into a subnational unit of a larger state. Prominent examples are Knöbl (2013), Safford (2013), Lynch (1998), and, at the time *LSF* was in press, Knight (2022). An exquisitely synthetic book that indirectly documents state formation without even referring to it is Bushnell and Macaulay (1994: chs. 9, 10, and 11). These works tend to overlook the international economic conditions that made state formation possible.

Most works analyzing the consolidation of a specific type of regime, namely, **oligarchy**, take for granted that a great extent of state formation had been achieved before the consolidation of such regime. See for instance Dennis (2017) and Foweraker (2020). This literature does consider the economic sources of the emerging political regime, but they would benefit from the insights of state theory. The paradigmatic case of the analysis of oligarchic rule rooted in economic structures is Cardoso and Faletto (1979), but it skips altogether the problem of state formation.

Works centered on **nation** building, largely abstracting from the precedent process of state formation, are Castro-Klarén and Chasteen (2003), Del Val (2004), and Quijada (1994) for Spanish America, and Murilo de Carvalho (1994) and Graham (1994) for Brazil.

The **boom in international trade** that created the incentives and resources for state formation is best documented by Glade (1986), Bulmer-Thomas (2003: chs. 3-4), Bértola and Williamson (2006), Bértola and Ocampo (2015: ch. 3). Cortés Conde (2006) and Marichal (2005) are the most updated analyses of the fiscal aspects of the boom, crucial for state formation, and Summerhill (2006) is a masterful synthesis on the development of infrastructure, also crucial for state formation. On the effects of the international economic context, see De Abreu (2006) for a general assessment, Taylor (2006) for foreign investments, and Bulmer-Thomas (2006) for international demand of commodities. On British economic influence, Rippey (1966) remains an exemplary work for the entire region, as is Graham (1968) for Brazil and Ferns (1966) for Argentina. For an updated survey Miller (2014: chs. 3, 5, 6, and 7) wonderfully inserts political and diplomatic facts and insights to help connect subperiods of an eminently economic process.

- Bértola, Luis, and Jeffrey Williamson. 2006. "Globalization in Latin America Before 1940." In Victor Bulmer-Thomas, Victor, John Coatsworth, and Roberto Cortes-Conde (eds.). *The Cambridge Economic History of Latin America*, Vol. II. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press: 9-56.
- Bértola, Luis, and José Antonio Ocampo. 2015. *The Economic Development of Latin America Since Independence*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Bulmer-Thomas, Victor, John Coatsworth, and Roberto Cortes-Conde (eds.). 2006. *The Cambridge Economic History of Latin America*, Vol. II. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press
- Bulmer-Thomas, Victor. 2003. *The Economic History of Latin America Since Independence*. New York: Cambridge University Press.
- Bulmer-Thomas, Victor. 2006. "Globalization and the New Economic Model in Latin America." In Victor Bulmer-Thomas, Victor, John Coatsworth, and Roberto Cortes-Conde (eds.). *The Cambridge Economic History of Latin America*, Vol. II. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press: 135-166.
- Bushnell, David, and Neill Macaulay. 1994. *The Emergence of Latin America in the Nineteenth Century*. New York and Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Cardoso, Fernando Henrique, and Enzo Faletto. 1979. *Dependency and Development in Latin America*. Berkeley: University of California Press.
- Castro-Klarén, Sara, and John Charles Chasteen (eds.). 2003. *Beyond Imagined Communities: Reading and Writing the Nation in Nineteenth-century Latin America*. Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press.
- Cortés Conde, Roberto. 2006. "Fiscal and Monetary Regimes." In Victor Bulmer-Thomas, John Coatsworth, and Roberto Cortes-Conde (eds.). *The Cambridge Economic History of Latin America*, Vol. II. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press: 209-248.
- De Abreu, Marcelo. (2006). "The External Context." In Victor Bulmer-Thomas, John Coatsworth, and Roberto Cortes-Conde (eds.). *The Cambridge Economic History of Latin America*, Vol. II. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press: 101-134.
- Del Val, José. 2004. *México: Identidad y Nación*. Mexico: Ediciones de UNAM.
- Ferns, Henry S. 1966. *Gran Bretaña y Argentina en el Siglo XIX*. Buenos Aires: Solar/Hachette.
- Foweraker, Joe. 2020. *Oligarchy in the Americas: Comparing Oligarchic Rule in Latin America and the United States*. Cham: Springer Nature.
- Gilbert, Dennis. 2017. *The Oligarchy and the Old Regime in Latin America, 1880-1970*. Lanham: Rowman & Littlefield.
- Glade, William. 1986. "Latin America and the International Economy, 1870-1914." In Leslie Bethell (ed.). *The Cambridge History of Latin America*, Vol. IV. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press: 1-56.
- Graham, Richard. 1968. *Britain and the Onset of Modernization in Brazil 1850-1914*. New York: Cambridge University Press.
- Graham, Richard. 1994. "Formando una Nación en el Brasil del Siglo XIX." In Antonio Annino, Luis Castro Leiva, François-Xavier Guerra (eds.). *De los Imperios a las Naciones: Iberoamérica*. Zaragoza: Ibercaja: 501-532.
- Knight, Alan. 2022. *Bandits and Liberals, Rebels and Saints: Latin America Since Independence*. Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press.
- Knöbl, Wolfgang. 2013. "State building in Western Europe and the Americas in the Long Nineteenth Century: Some Preliminary Considerations." In Miguel A. Centeno, and Agustín E. Ferraro (eds.). *State Building in Latin America and Spain. Republics of the Possible*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press: 56-76.

- Lynch, John. 1998. "La Formación de los Estados Nuevos." In Salmoral, Manuel Lucena (ed.). *Historia de Iberoamérica*, Vol. III. Madrid: Ediciones Cátedra.
- Marichal, Carlos. 2005. "Money, Taxes, and Finance." In Victor Bulmer-Thomas, Victor, John Coatsworth, and Roberto Cortes-Conde (eds.). *The Cambridge Economic History of Latin America*, Vol. I. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press: 423-460.
- Miller, Rory. *Britain and Latin America in the 19th and 20th Centuries*. London: Routledge.
- Murilo de Carvalho, José. 1994, "Brasil. Naciones Imaginadas." In Antonio Annino, Luis Castro Leiva, François-Xavier Guerra (eds.). *De los Imperios a las Naciones: Iberoamérica*. Zaragoza: Ibercaja: 501-532.
- Quijada, Mónica. 1994. "¿Qué Nación? Dinámicas y Dicotomías de la Nación en el Imaginario Hispanoamericano." In Antonio Annino, Luis Castro Leiva, François-Xavier Guerra (eds.). *De los Imperios a las Naciones: Iberoamérica*. Zaragoza: Ibercaja: 287-314.
- Safford, Frank. 2013 "The Construction of National States in Latin America, 1820-1890." In Miguel A. Centeno, and Agustín E. Ferraro (eds.). *State Building in Latin America and Spain. Republics of the Possible*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press: 25-55.
- Summerhill, William. 2006. "The Development of Infrastructure." In Victor Bulmer-Thomas, Victor, John Coatsworth, and Roberto Cortes-Conde (eds.). *The Cambridge Economic History of Latin America*, Vol. II. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press: 293-326.
- Taylor, Alan. 2006. "Foreign Capital Flows." In Victor Bulmer-Thomas, Victor, John Coatsworth, and Roberto Cortes-Conde (eds.). *The Cambridge Economic History of Latin America*, Vol. II. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press: 57-100.

Chapter 5

Before Argentina

The account of **state failure** in Argentina is based on traditional accounts and contemporary syntheses, but it provides a new organizing principle to both. The traditional accounts include Mitre (1902 [1857]), Saldías (1892), López (1913), and Levene (1921, 1936). Synthetic works of the period were pioneered by Scobie (1971), Gorostegui de Torres (1972), and Halperin Donghi (1972a, 1972b, 1982). The best new syntheses are Rock (1987: Ch 3), Lynch (1993), Garavaglia (2007), Ternavasio (2009), and Paz (2011). A fundamental primary source for the failed attempts at political organization is Instituto de Investigaciones Históricas (1937-39).

Wars among regions in the territory of what today is Argentina, the main sign of state failure, have been studied from two perspectives: one emphasizing **opposite economic interests**, and the other focusing on the politics of **caudillismo** (warlordism). Alberdi (1916) and Varela (1929) are the founders of the school of economy-centered civil conflict. A big push toward synthesis was made by Alvarez (1914) and Bushnell (1983). Chiaramonte (1997), Halperin Donghi (1995), and Paz (2007) provide outstanding selections of primary documents, with uniquely insightful preliminary studies.¹

The pioneer thinker of **caudillismo** in Argentina is Sarmiento (1845). The first rigorous scholarly approach is Halperin Donghi (1965), who inspired several sequels, including Zorrilla (1972; 1994), Chiaramonte and Buchbinder (1992), Goldman and Salvatore (2005), and De la Fuente (2007)².

¹ Further readings on the economic context are Gelman (2005, 2010), Míguez (2012), Garavaglia (1987), Johnson (2021), Assadourian and Palomeque (2003), and Schmit (2010).

² Additional readings on caudillismo and local political/military conflict are Rabinovich (2012), Frega (2002), Chiaramonte (1986), Goldman (1993), and Fradklyn and Gelman (2015).

- Alberdi, Juan Bautista. 1916. *Estudios Económicos: Interpretación Económica de la Historia Política Argentina y Sud-americana*. Buenos Aires: La Cultura.
- Álvarez, Juan. 1914. *Estudio sobre las Guerras Civiles Argentinas*. Buenos Aires: J. Roldan.
- Assadourian, Carlos Sempat, and Palomeque, Silvia. 2003. "Síntesis sobre las Relaciones Mercantiles Interregionales en la Primera Década del siglo XIX." In María Alejandra Irigoin and Roberto Schmit (eds.). *La Desintegración de la Economía Colonial. Comercio y Moneda en el Interior del Espacio Colonial (1800-1860)*. Buenos Aires: Biblos: 167-202.
- Botana, Natalio R. 2016. *Repúblicas y Monarquías: la Encrucijada de la Independencia*. Buenos Aires: Edhasa.
- Burgin, Miron. 1946. *The Economic Aspects of Argentine Federalism 1820-1852*. Cambridge: Harvard University Press.
- Bushnell, David. 1983. *Reform and Reaction in the Platine Provinces, 1810-1852*. Gainesville: University Press of Florida.
- Camareno, Hernan. 2000. "Perspectivas Historiográficas en Torno al Caudillismo Argentino del Siglo XIX." *Revista de Historia* 41: 9-48.
- Chiaramonte, José Carlos. 1986. "Legalidad Constitucional o Caudillismo: el Problema del Orden Social en el Surgimiento de los Estados Autónomos del Litoral Argentino en la Primera Mitad del Siglo XIX." *Desarrollo Económico*, 26.102: 175-196.
- Chiaramonte, José Carlos. 1991. *Mercaderes del Litoral: Economía y Sociedad en la Provincia de Corrientes, Primera mitad del siglo XIX*. Buenos Aires: Fondo de Cultura Económica.
- Chiaramonte, José Carlos. 1997. *Ciudades, Provincias, Estados: Orígenes de la Nación Argentina 1800-1846*. Buenos Aires: Ariel.
- Chiaramonte, José Carlos, and Pablo Buchbinder. 1992. "Provincias, Caudillos, Nación y la Historiografía Constitucionalista Argentina, 1853-1930." *Anuario IEHS* 7: 93-120.
- De la Fuente, Ariel. 2007. *Los Hijos de Facundo*. Buenos Aires: Prometeo.
- Fradklyn, Raúl, and Juan Gelman. 2015. *Juan Manuel de Rosas: la Construcción de un Liderazgo Político*. Argentina: Edhasa.
- Frega, Aldo. 2002. "Caudillos y Montoneras en la Revolución Radical Artiguista." *Andes*.
- Garavaglia, Juan Carlos. 1987. *Economía, Sociedad y Regiones*. Argentina: Ediciones de la Flor.
- Garavaglia, Juan Carlos. 2007. *Construir el Estado, Inventar La Nación: El Río de la Plata, Siglos XVIII-XIX*. Buenos Aires: Prometeo Libros.
- Gelman, Juan. 2002. "La Rebelión de los Estancieros contra Rosas: Algunas Reflexiones en Torno a los Libres del Sur de 1839." *Entrepassados*, 11.22: 113-144.
- Gelman, Juan. 2005. *Rosas, Estanciero: Gobierno y Expansión Ganadera*. Argentina: Capital Intelectual.
- Gelman, Juan. 2010. "La Gran Divergencia. Las Economías Regionales en Argentina Después de la Independencia." *La Historia Económica y los Procesos de Independencia en la América Hispana*, 105-129.
- Goldman, Noemi. 1993. "Legalidad y Legitimidad en el Caudillismo. Juan Facundo Quiroga y La Rioja en el Interior Rioplatense (1810-1835)." *Boletín del Instituto de Historia Argentina y Americana Dr. Emilio Ravignani*, 3(7):
- Goldman, Noemí, and Ricardo D. Salvatore. 2005. *Caudillismos Rioplatenses: Nuevas Miradas a un Viejo Problema*. Buenos Aires: Eudeba.
- Gorostegui de Torres, Haydée. 1972. *Argentina: La Organización Nacional*. Buenos Aires: Paidós.
- Halperín Donghi, Tulio. 1978. "Militarización Revolucionaria en Buenos Aires, 1806-1815." *El Ocaso del Orden Colonial en Hispanoamérica*, 121-157.

- Halperín Donghi, Tulio. 1965. "El Surgimiento de los Caudillos en el Marco de la Sociedad Rioplatense Postrevolucionaria," *Estudios de Historia Social*, 1.1: 121-149.
- Halperín Donghi, Tulio. 1972a. *De la Revolución de Independencia a la Confederación Rosista*. Buenos Aires: Editorial Paidós.
- Halperín Donghi, Tulio. 1972b. *Revolución y Guerra*. Buenos Aires: Siglo XXI.
- Halperín Donghi, Tulio. 1982. *Guerra y Finanzas en los Orígenes del Estado Argentino (1791-1850)*. Buenos Aires: Editorial de Belgrano.
- Halperín Donghi, Tulio. 1995. *Proyecto y Construcción de una Nación: Argentina, 1846-1880*. Buenos Aires: Ariel.
- Instituto de Investigaciones Históricas. 1937-39. *Asambleas Constituyentes Argentinas*. Buenos Aires: Peuser.
- Johnson, Lyman. 2021. *Los Talleres de la Revolución: La Buenos Aires Plebeya y el Mundo Del Atlántico, 1776-1810*. Argentina: Prometeo Libros.
- Lettieri, Alberto. 1998. *La República de la Opinión: Política y Opinión Pública en Buenos Aires entre 1852 y 1862*. Argentina: Editorial Biblos.
- Levene, Ricardo. 1921. *Período de la Emancipación y Organización Nacional*. Buenos Aires: Lajouane.
- Levene, Ricardo. 1936. *Historia de la Nación Argentina*. Buenos Aires: La Universidad.
- López, Vicente Fidel. 1913. *Historia de la República Argentina, su Origen, su Revolución y su Desarrollo Político Hasta 1852*. Buenos Aires: Kraft.
- Lynch, David. 1993. "From Independence to National Organization." In Leslie Bethell (ed.). *Argentina Since Independence*. New York: Cambridge University Press.
- Míguez, Eduardo. 2012. *Historia Económica de la Argentina: De la Conquista a la Crisis de 1930*. Argentina: Sudamericana.
- Mitre, Bartolomé. 1902 [1857]. *Historia de Belgrano y de la Independencia Argentina*. Buenos Aires: Biblioteca de La Nación.
- Paz, Gustavo. 2007. *Las Guerras Civiles (1820-1870)*. Buenos Aires: Eudeba.
- Paz, Gustavo. 2011. "La Vida Política." In Raúl Fradkin and Juan Carlos Garavaglia (eds.). *Argentina. La Construcción Nacional*. Madrid: Taurus.
- Rabinovich, Alejandro. 2011. "Obedecer y comandar. La Formación de un Cuerpo de Oficiales en los Ejércitos del Río de la Plata, 1810-1820." *Estudios Sociales*, 41, 41-67.
- Rabinovich, Alejandro. 2012. "La Militarización del Río de la Plata, 1810-1820: Elementos Cuantitativos y Conceptuales para un análisis." *Boletín del Instituto de Historia Argentina y Americana Dr. Emilio Ravignani*, (37), 11-42.
- Saldías, Adolfo. 1892. *Historia de la Confederación Argentina*. Argentina: Buenos Aires: Lajouane.
- Salvatore, Ricardo. 2018. *Paisanos Itinerantes: Orden Estatal y Experiencia Subalterna en Buenos Aires durante la era de Rosas*. Argentina: Prometeo Libros.
- Sarmiento, Domingo Faustino. 1845. *Facundo. Civilización i Barbarie*. Santiago de Chile: Imprenta del Progreso.
- Schmit, Roberto. 2010. "Las Consecuencias Económicas de la Revolución en el Río de la Plata." Bandieri, S.(comp.) *La Historia Económica y los Procesos de Independencia en la América Hispana. Un Abordaje Continental*. Buenos Aires: AAHE-Prometeo Libros.
- Scobie, James R. 1971. *Argentina: a City and a Nation*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Ternavasio, Marcela. 2002. *La Revolución del Voto: Política y Elecciones en Buenos Aires, 1810-1852*. Argentina: Siglo Veintiuno Editores.
- Ternavasio, Marcela. 2005. *Correspondencia de Juan Manuel de Rosas*. Argentina: Eudeba.
- Ternavasio, Marcela. 2007. *Gobernar la Revolución: Poderes en Disputa en el Río de la Plata, 1810-1816*. Argentina: Siglo Veintiuno Editores.

- Ternavasio, Marcela. 2009. *Historia de la Argentina: 1806-1852*. Buenos Aires: Siglo XXI.
- Varela, Florencio. 1929. "Sobre la Libre Navegación de los Ríos," *Rosas y Sus Opositores*, Buenos Aires: Gleizer.
- Zorrilla, Rubén H. 1972. *Extracción Social de los Caudillos, 1810-1870*. Buenos Aires: Editorial La Pléyade.
- Zorrilla, Rubén H. 1994. *Estructura Social y Caudillismo*. Buenos Aires: Grupo Editor Latinoamericano.

Chapter 6

Port-driven State Formation in Argentina

The account of state formation in Argentina is based on several primary sources, some of them previously untapped. It is also compatible with the traditional accounts, and several contemporary syntheses, but it crucially provides a new perspective to re-interpret them.

The primary sources for this chapter are both local and diplomatic. The main local sources are the *Archivo del General Mitre* (esp. vols. 8, 9, 10, and 11), the correspondence of Mitre during 1861-1862 in *Museo Mitre*, the *Archivo Urquiza* at *Archivo General de la Nación*, and a series of previously unexplored documents by Régulo Martínez (reports and correspondence written between 1855 and 1862), some of which are located in the *Archivo del Museo Sarmiento* and some are held by his descendants. This source is fabulous: Martínez was tasked by Mitre to provide political intelligence on the states of Santiago, Salta, Tucumán, and La Rioja (a virtual spy of Buenos Aires in the Interior), and was the only person on whom Mitre and Sarmiento relied to send messages to each other after they stopped communicating directly. Diplomatic sources include the reports of the British Consuls to the Foreign Office in 1859-62 (esp. Thornton to Russell), and the previously unanalyzed reports by the Spanish Consul Creus during 1860-61 (*Museo Social Argentino*, 1993). The Creus reports provide unique insight into Urquiza's motivations.

The main traditional accounts are Levene (1936), Pelliza (1951), and De Vedia y Mitre (1952). The best synthetic works are Rock (1987: Ch. 4), Bonaudo (1999), and Sábato (2019).

The four main monographic works on **Argentine state formation** are by historians Scobie (1964) and Rock (2019), and by political scientists Oszlak (1982) and Botana (1977). Scobie focuses on a distinctly unifying event, the Battle of Pavón, and its political aftermath. Both Rock and Scobie document and analyze almost exclusively political struggles and negotiations, abstracting from the economic background that is so central in the theory of trade-led state formation advanced by *LSF*. Botana provides a uniquely inspiring insight, which I make central in my book: the confirmation that, in the founding moments of the country, the peripherie-extracted shares of political power from the center that were substantially out of proportion in relation to their demographic and economic value. Yet, Botana focuses on the rise of a political oligarchy (as a ruling group) rather than the emergence of the basic structures of the state (territory and monopoly of violence). Additionally, Botana dates the origins of the Argentine state around 1880, whereas this chapter shows the benefits of dating it around 1862. Oszlak is a structural interpretation of state formation giving primacy to the impersonal forces of capitalism—with an aspiring Althusserian vocabulary that has been largely discredited by modern social sciences. Crucially, the politics of the process is a big blind spot in Oszlack.³

In contrast to these four works, this chapter integrates both **long-term economic sources** of state formation in Argentina (which makes it a paradigmatic case of trade-led state formation) and **short-term political strategies**, which make it a political entrepreneur variant of the general trade-led pattern.

³ Additional reading on specific territorial, legal, military, and fiscal aspects of the process of state formation are Adelman (2002), AA.VV. (2010), Alonso and Bragoni (2015), Sabato and Ternavasio (2015), and Zimmermann (1998).

The reconstruction of the **economic background**, with an emphasis on the wool and wheat boom as the first real window of opportunity at unification, is based on the pioneering work by Gibson (1893), and the important contributions by Ortiz (1955), Scobie (1964), and Sábato (1989). This line of inquiry has been updated by Amaral (2002) and Gallo (2004). Crucial synthetic works are Brown (1979), Corte Conde (1997), Gerchunoff (2010), and Hora (2010).⁴

In addition to the primary documents, the reconstruction of **political strategies** is based on Alberdi (1897: vol. 5), Rivarola (1921), Scobie (1964), Equipos de Investigación Histórica (1965), and Míguez (2018, 2021) for accounts centered on Mitre as a political entrepreneur, and Mariano Ruiz Moreno (1913), McLynn (1976), and Ruiz Moreno (1965, 2012) for accounts centered on Urquiza's motivations.⁵

⁴ Additional readings on the economic context of the period are Adelman (1994), Della Paolera and Taylor (2003), Schmit and Barsky (2008), Djenderedjian (2003), and Sánchez (2015).

⁵ See also Adelman (2002) and Moreno (2015).

Primary Sources: with a few exceptions noted above, the primary sources are all described in the endnotes of the chapter.

Secondary Sources:

- AA.VV. 2010. *La Construcción de la Nación Argentina: El Rol de las Fuerzas Armadas*. Buenos Aires: Ministerio de Defensa.
- Adelman, Jeremy. 1994. *Frontier Development: Land, Labour, and Capital on the Wheatlands of Argentina and Canada, 1890-1914*. New York: Oxford University Press.
- Adelman, Jeremy. 2002. *Republic of Capital: Buenos Aires and the Legal Transformation of the Atlantic World*. Stanford: Stanford University Press.
- Alonso, Paula, and Beatriz Bragoni (eds.). 2015. *El Sistema Federal Argentino: Debates y Coyunturas (1860-1910)*. Buenos Aires: Edhasa.
- Amaral, Samuel. 2002. *The Rise of Capitalism on the Pampas: The Estancias of Buenos Aires, 1785-1870*. New York: Cambridge University Press.
- Banzato, Gustavo, and Lanteri, Silvia. 2007. "Forjando la Frontera. Políticas Públicas y Estrategias Privadas en el Río de la Plata, 1780-1860." *Historia Agraria*. 17(43), 435-458.
- Bonaudo, Marta (ed.). 1999. *Liberalismo, Estado y Orden Burgués (1852-1880)*. Buenos Aires: Editorial Sudamericana.
- Botana, Natalio. 1977. *El Orden Conservador: la Política Argentina entre 1880 y 1916*. Buenos Aires: Sudamericana.
- Brown, Jonathan. 1979. *A Socioeconomic History of Argentina, 1776-1860*. New York: Cambridge University Press.
- Chávez, Fermín. 1962. *Vida del Chacho*. Buenos Aires: Theoría.
- Cortés Conde, Roberto. 1997. *La Economía Argentina en el Largo Plazo: Ensayos de Historia Económica de los Siglos XIX y XX*. Buenos Aires: Editorial Sudamericana/Universidad de San Andrés.
- De Vedia y Mitre, Mariano. *Historia de la Unidad Nacional*. Buenos Aires: Secretaría de Cultura.
- Della Paolera, Gerardo, and Taylor, Alan M. (eds.). 2003. *A New Economic History of Argentina*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Djenderedjian, Juan. 2003. *Historia del Capitalismo Agrario Pampeano: la Expansión Ganadera Hasta 1895*. Buenos Aires: Siglo Veintiuno.
- Equipos de Investigación Histórica. 1965. *Pavón y la Crisis de la Confederación*, Buenos Aires: n/a.
- Gallo, Ezequiel. 2004. *La Pampa Gringa: la Colonización Agrícola en Santa Fe 1870-1895*. Buenos Aires: Edhasa.
- Gerchunoff, Pablo. 2010. "Causas y Azares... en Más de un Siglo de Historia Económica Argentina." In Roberto Russell (ed.). *Argentina 1910-2010: Balance de un Siglo*. Buenos Aires: Taurus: 103-165.
- Gibson, Herbert. 1893. *The History and Present State of the Sheep-Breeding Industry in the Argentine Republic*. Edinburgh: Ravenscroft and Mills.

- Halperín Donghi, Tulio. 1963. La Expansión Ganadera en la Campaña de Buenos Aires (1810-1852). *Desarrollo Económico*, 57-110.
- Hora, Roy. 2010. *Historia Económica de la Argentina: Siglo XIX*. Buenos Aires: Siglo Veintiuno Editores.
- Levene, Ricardo. 1936. *Historia de la Nación Argentina*. Buenos Aires: La Universidad.
- McLynn, Frank Joseph. 1976. *General Urquiza and the Politics of Argentina 1861-1870*. Dissertation, University College of London.
- Míguez, Eduardo José. 2018. *Bartolomé Mitre: entre la Nación y la Historia*. Buenos Aires: Edhasa.
- Míguez, Eduardo José. 2021. *Los Trece Ranchos: las Provincias, Buenos Aires, y la Formación de la Nación Argentina, 1840-1880*. Rosario: Prohistoria Ediciones.
- Moreno, Ignacio Javier. 2015. "Llegada de Mitre a la Presidencia. Buenos Aires y el Gobierno Nacional." *Investigaciones y Ensayos*, (61), 435-481.
- Museo Social Argentino. 1993. *Informes Españoles Sobre Argentina*. Buenos Aires: UMSA.
- Ortíz, Ricardo M. 1955. *Historia Económica de la Argentina*, Buenos Aires: Editorial Raigal.
- Oszlak, Oscar. 1982. *La Formación del Estado Argentino*. Buenos Aires: Editorial Planeta.
- Pelliza, Mariano. 1951. *La Organización Nacional*. Buenos Aires: Suelo Argentino.
- Rivarola, Rodolfo. 1921. *Mitre: Una Década De Su Vida Política, 1852-1862. Ensayo Sobre la Formación De Su Personalidad Nacional*. Buenos Aires: Revista Argentina de Ciencias Políticas.
- Rock, David. 1987. *Argentina, 1516-1987: From Spanish Colonization to Alfonsín*. Berkeley: University of California Press.
- Ruiz Moreno, Isidoro, 1965. "El Litoral Después de Pavón," in Equipos de Investigación Histórica (eds.), *Pavón y la Crisis de la Confederación*, Buenos Aires: n/a.
- Ruiz Moreno, Isidoro, 2012. *El Misterio de Pavón*. Buenos Aires: Claridad.
- Ruiz Moreno, Martín. 1913. *La Presidencia del Dr. Santiago Derqui y la Batalla de Pavón*. Buenos Aires: Roldán.
- Sábato, Hilda, and Marcela Ternavasio. 2015. "De las Repúblicas Rioplatenses a la República Argentina. Debates y dilemas sobre la cuestión republicana en el siglo XIX." In Pilar González Bernaldo de Quirós (ed.). *Independencias Iberoamericanas. Nuevos Problemas y Aproximaciones*, 237-272.
- Sábato, Hilda. 1983. "Wool Trade and Commercial Networks in Buenos Aires, 1840s to 1880s." *Journal of Latin American Studies*, 15.1; 49-81.
- Sábato, Hilda. 1989. *Capitalismo y Ganadería en Buenos Aires: La Fiebre del Lanar, 1850-1890*. Buenos Aires: Editorial Sudamericana.
- Sábato, Hilda. 2019. *Historia de la Argentina, 1852-1890*. Buenos Aires: Siglo XXI Editores.
- Sánchez, S. F. 2015. "Situación económica y Militar de Argentina entre 1852 y el Inicio de la Guerra del Paraguay." *Navigator*, 11(21), 23-34.
- Schmit, Roberto, and Osvaldo Barsky. 2008. *Los Límites del Progreso: Expansión Rural en los Orígenes del Capitalismo Rioplatense; Entre Ríos, 1852-1872*. Argentina: Siglo Veintiuno.
- Scobie, James. 1964. *Revolution on the Pampas: a Social History of Argentine Wheat*. Austin: University of Texas Press.
- Tenti, María Mercedes. 2012. "El proto-Estado Taboadista, Santiago del Estero (1852-1875)." *Andes*, 23(2).

Zimmermann, Eduardo. 1998. "El Poder Judicial, la construcción del estado, y el federalismo: Argentina, 1860-1880." In Eduardo Posada-Carbo (ed.). *Search of a New Order: Essays on the Politics of Nineteenth-Century Latin America*. Londres: ILAS: 131-152.

Chapter 7

Port-led State Formation in Brazil

This account of Brazilian state-formation is compatible with, yet distinct from, traditional Brazilian historiography, modern monographies on the period, and current synthetic works of the entire history of Brazil. Classical works are Sergio Buarque de Holanda (1962, 1964), Duarte Moreira de Azevedo (1884), and Pereira da Silva (1878) in Portuguese, and Haring (1958) in English. An indispensable contemporary account is Armiteage (1836). Current syntheses include Murilo de Carvalho (1980), Bethell and Murilo De Carvalho (1985), Barman (1994), Needell (2006), Skidmore (2009), Fausto and Fausto (2014), and Faoro (2021).

A key contribution of this chapter is to show that Brazil was also subject to **warlordism** (*colonelismo*) and **secessionism**, and therefore was not an exception to the general pattern of state failure in Latin America—a fact that is regularly obscured by accounts emphasizing Brazilian continuity between national borders and colonial borders, which in effect no other Latin America country could keep. Moreover, the chapter shows that projects to create splinter states in Brazil were frequent, fiscally viable, and durable. In several junctures during the Regency period, different parts of Brazil seceded from Rio de Janeiro. The reconstruction of the period of state failure based on *colonelismo* and secessionism is based on Varela (1933), Spalding (1963), Filler (1976), Leal (1977), Leitman (1973), Naro (1981), Reis (1995), Barman (1994), da Silva Dias (2005), Mosher (2000), Padoin (2001), Dolhnikoff (2003, 2005), Fausto and Fausto (2014: 70-120), and Machado (2022).

The chapter also shows that international trade, especially coffee exports, helped re-unify Brazilian states. The case for **trade-led state formation** in Brazil is based on some fundamental primary sources, including centrally Castro Carreira (1889). Key monographs on the capitalist modernization of Brazil, and the coffee sector in particular, which allowed for trade-led state formation, are Graham (1968), Fernandes (1975), Matos (1974), Batista Jr. (1980) Stein (1985), Font (1990), Topic (2002), Needell (2006: ch. 1), and Devoto and Fausto (2004: 32-45).

Chapter 7 further claims that Brazil followed a **port-driven** variant of trade-led state formation. The *Saquarema* political entrepreneurs based on Rio—Brazil's main port—led the process of reunification. They became the key brokers of a multi-region process in order to safeguard their political careers. On this topic, the pathbreaking work of Palmer (1950) was followed by Mattos (1994), Ferreira (1999), and Needell (2006). A substantial body of work deals with specific aspects of state building in Brazil, which however converge on the centrality of the *Saquarema* power: Flory (1981) studies the judicial system, and Pang and Seckinger (1971) and Barman and Barman (1976) focus on proto-technocrats.

The outcome of a **semi-patrimonial state** as the result of the state formation process is illustrated by Celso (1910), Schwartzman (1971), Graham (1994, 1995), and Faoro (2021).

Finally, several comparative studies contrasting the developmental trajectories of Brazil and Argentina were produced in the 1980s. These include Alimonda (1982), Merquior (1986), Murilo de Carvalho (1986), and Trindade (1986). They all emphasize differences between the cases, probably for lack of a broader comparative perspective, not only with other cases of Latin America but also with Western Europe. Consequently, they miss the key similarities in terms

of the trade-led path of state formation (based on wool and wheat for Argentina, and on coffee for Brazil), and the shared port-led variant of it (based the political entrepreneurship of *Mitrisimo* in Argentina and of *Saquaremas* in Brazil). The comparison of development trajectories between Argentina and Brazil has recently been updated in a massive book by Devoto and Fausto (2004). While the book sees more similarities than the prior generation of Argentina/Brazil comparisons, it also lacks the analytical power provided by political science theory to identify precisely when and why the process of state formation took place.

Primary Sources: all included in the endnotes of the chapter.

Secondary Sources

- Alimonda, Héctor. 1982. “‘Paz y Administración’ y ‘Ordem e Progresso’: Notas Para un Estudio Comparativo de los Estados Oligárquicos Argentino y Brasileño,” *Revista Mexicana de Sociología*, 44.4: 1323-1350.
- Armitage, John. 1836. *History of Brazil From the Arrival of the Braganza Family in 1808 to the Abdication of Dom Pedro I* (2 vols.). London: Smith, Elder & Company.
- Barman, Roderick. 1994. *Brazil: the Forging of a Nation, 1798-1852*. Redwood: Stanford University Press.
- Barman, Roderick, and Jean Barman. 1976. “The Role of the Law Graduate in the Political Elite of Imperial Brazil.” *Journal of Interamerican Studies and World Affairs*, 18.4: 423-450
- Batista Jr., Paulo N. 1980. “Política Tarifária Britânica e Evolução das Exportações Brasileiras na Primeira Metade do Século XIX.” *Revista Brasileira de Economia*, 34.2: 203-240.
- Bethell, Leslie, and José Murilo De Carvalho. 1985. “Brazil from Independence to the Middle of the Nineteenth Century.” *The Cambridge History of Latin America*, 3: 679-746.
- Buarque de Holanda, Sergio. 1962. *História Geral da Civilização Brasileira. Volume I: O Processo de Emancipação*. São Paulo: Difusão Européia do Livro.
- Buarque de Holanda, Sergio. 1964. *História Geral da Civilização Brasileira. Volume II: Dispersão e Unidade*. São Paulo: Difusão Européia do Livro.
- Castro Carreira, Liberato, 1889. *Historia Financeira e Orçamentaria do Imperio do Brazil Desde a Sua Fundação: Precedida de Alguns Apontamentos Acerca da Sua Independencia*. Rio de Janeiro: Imprensa Nacional.
- Celso, Affonso. 1901. *Oito Annos de Parlamento*. Rio de Janeiro: Laemmert.
- Coser, Ivo. 2011. “O Debate Entre Centralizadores e Federalistas no Século XIX.” *Revista Brasileira de Ciências Sociais*, 26.76: 191-206.
- d’Escragnolle Tunay, Affonso. 1939-43. *Historia do Café*. Rio de Janeiro: Departamento Nacional do Café.
- da Silva Dias, Maria Odila Leite. 2005. *A Interiorização da Metrópole e Outros Estudos*. Rio de Janeiro: Alameda.
- Devoto, Fernando and Boris Fausto. 2004. *Argentina/Brazil (1850-2000)*, Buenos Aires: Sudamericana.
- Dolhnikoff, Miriam. 2003. “O Lugar Das Elites Regionais.” *Revista USP*, 58: 116-133.
- Dolhnikoff, Miriam. 2005. *O Pacto Imperial: Origens do Federalismo no Brasil do Século XIX*. São Paulo: Globo.
- Duarte Moreira de Azevedo, Manuel. 1884. *História Patria: O Brasil de 1831 a 1840*. Rio de Janeiro: BL Garnier.
- Faoro, Raymundo. 2021. *Os Donos do Poder: Formação do Patronato Político Brasileiro*. Rio de Janeiro: Companhia das Letras.
- Fausto, Boris, and Sergio Fausto. 2014. *A Concise History of Brazil*. New York: Cambridge University Press.
- Fernandez, Florestan. 1975. *A Revolução Burguesa no Brasil. Parte 1: As Origens da Revolução Burguesa*. Rio de Janeiro: Zahar.
- Ferreira, Gabriela Nunes. 1999. *Centralização e Descentralização no Império: o Debate Entre Tavares Bastos e Visconde do Uruguai*. São Paulo: Universidade de São Paulo Editora.
- Filler, Victor Morris. 1976. *Liberalism in Imperial Brazil: the Regional Rebellions of 1842*. Stanford: Stanford University.

- Flory, Thomas. 1981. *Judge and Jury in Imperial Brazil, 1808–1871: Social Control and Political Stability in the New State*. Austin: University of Texas Press.
- Font, Mauricio. 1990. *Coffee, Contention, and Change in the Making of Modern Brazil*. London: Blackwell.
- Graham, Richard. 1968. *Britain and the Onset of Modernization in Brazil 1850–1914*. New York: Cambridge University Press.
- Graham, Richard. 1994. *Patronage and Politics in Nineteenth Century Brazil*. Stanford: Stanford University Press.
- Graham, Richard. 1995. “Formando un Gobierno Central: las Elecciones y el Orden Monárquico en el Brasil del siglo XIX.” In Antonio Annino (ed.). *Historia de las Elecciones en Iberoamericana, siglo XIX: de la Formación del Espacio Político Nacional*. Mexico: Fondo de Cultura Económica.
- Haring, Clarence H. 1958. *Empire in Brazil. A New World Experiment with Monarchy*. Cambridge: WW Norton Company.
- Leitman, Spencer L. 1973. “Cattle and Caudillos in Brazil’s Southern Borderland, 1828 to 1850” *Ethnohistory*, 20.2: 188–198
- Matos, Odilon Nogueira de. 1974. *Café e Ferrovias: a Evolução Ferroviária de São Paulo e o Desenvolvimento da Cultura Cafeeira*. São Paulo: Alfa-Omega e Sociologia e Política.
- Mattos, Ilmar Rohloff. 1994. *O Tempo de Squarema: A Formação do Estado imperial*. Rio de Janeiro: ACESS.
- Merquior, José Guillermo. 1986. “Patterns of State-building in Brazil and Argentina.” In John Hall (ed.). *States in History*. Oxford: Basil Blackwell: 264–288.
- Mosher, Jeffrey. 2000. “Challenging Authority: Political Violence and the Regency in Pernambuco, Brazil, 1831–1835.” *Luso-Brazilian Review*, 37.2: 33–57
- Murilo de Carvalho, Jose. 1980. *A Construção da Ordem*. Rio de Janeiro: Campus Ltda.
- Murilo de Carvalho, Jose. 1982. “Political Elites and State Building: The Case of Nineteenth Century Brazil.” *Comparative Studies in Society and History*, 24.3: 378–399
- Naro, Nancy P. 1981. *The 1848 Praieira Revolt in Brazil*. Chicago: The University of Chicago Press.
- Needell, Jeffrey D. 2006. *The Party of Order: the Conservatives, the State, and Slavery in the Brazilian Monarchy, 1831–1871*. Stanford: Stanford University Press.
- Padoin, Maria Medianeira. 2001. *Federalismo Gaúcho*. São Paulo: Companhia Editora Nacional.
- Palmer, Jr., Thomas. 1950 “A Momentous Decade in Brazilian Administrative History, 1831–1840.” *The Hispanic American Historical Review*, 30.2: 209–217.
- Pang, Eul-Soo, and Ron Seckinger. 1971. “The Mandarins of Imperial Brazil”, *Comparative Studies in Society and History*, 14.2: 215–44.
- Pereira da Silva, João Manuel. 1878. *História do Brasil de 1831 a 1840*. Rio de Janeiro: Dias da Silva Junior Typographo-editor.
- Schwartzman, Simon. 1971. “Representación y Cooptación Política en el Brasil.” *Desarrollo Económico*, 11.41: 15–53.
- Skidmore, Thomas Elliot 2009. *Brazil: Five Centuries of Change*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Spalding, Walter. 1963. *A Epopeia Farroupilha*. Rio de Janeiro: Biblioteca do Exército Editora.
- Stein, Stanley. 1985. *Vassouras: A Brazilian Coffee County, 1850–1900. The Roles of Planter and Slave in a Plantation Society*. Princeton: Princeton University Press.
- Topik, Steven. 2002. “The Hollow State: the Effect of the World Market on State-building in Brazil in the Nineteenth Century. In James Dunkerley (ed.). *Studies in the Formation of the*

- Nation State in Latin America*, Institute of Latin American Studies/University of London: 112-132.
- Trindade, Helgio. 1986. "La Construcción del Estado Nacional en Argentina y Brasil (1810-1900)." *Revista Mexicana de Sociología*, 48.1: 137-166.
- Varela, Aureliano De Figueiredo Pinto. 1933. *História da Grande Revolução: o Cyclo Farroupilha no Brasil*. Rio de Janeiro: Oficinas Graficas da Livraria do Globo.

Chapter 8

Party-driven State Formation in Mexico

This account of state formation in Mexico is compatible with, yet distinct from, traditional accounts of Mexican history and current synthetic works of the entire history of Mexico. Classical works are Alamán (1942-48), Riva Palacio (1889), and Gonzalez (1977). Current syntheses include Bazant (1985a; 1985b) and Hamnett (2019).

A key contribution of Chapter 8 is to show the exact extent of **state failure** in Mexico from 1820 to 1870. Without using the phrase, most of the literature agrees that Mexico was a case of “state failure” in the period, essentially because of the loss of about half of its territory to the US and the recurrence of civil wars. Yet, the chapter introduces a deeply revisionist argument: it shows that territorial losses *could have been even worse*, but Mexican parties—usually blamed for disintegration—managed to prevent the secession of politically and economically vital sections of its territory. They avoided the hyper fragmentation observed in Central America. Hence, state failure was in fact followed by **state formation**, a success story starting around 1850 that had been overlooked both by political actors at the time and by historians. Like Argentina and Brazil, Mexico is a case of initial state failure followed by success at the specific **trade-led pathway** to state formation. In contrast to Argentina and Brazil, Mexico’s variant was **party-driven**.

State failure is vividly described in Bushnell and Macaulay (1994: ch. 4) and Zoraida Vázquez (1994). Tenenbaum (1986) documents the fiscal aspect of state failure, which she synthesized as “the politics of penury.” A major event of state failure was the loss of Texas, which has been the subject of many monographs. Guardino (2017) stands out for its clarity and range. Like Texas, Yucatán also attempted **secession**. The pioneer study is Cline (1947; 1948a; and 1948b). Particularly relevant for the argument of Chapter 8 is Gilbert (1985), who underscores the mutation from caste war to class war. Reed (2001) is the closest to a definitive monograph on the topic. Secessionism was not the only source of state failure in Mexico. **Caudillismo** was also prevalent: Lynch (1992: ch. 7), Buve (1992), Roniger (1987), Navarro (1977), and Díaz Díaz (1971).⁶

The re-incorporation of Yucatán, as well as the neutralization of secessionist attempts in the Northeast and in the Pacific center, indicates success at state formation. Mexico used two sources of revenue to fund territorial consolidation: the money derived from the sale of land to the US and, as in every other Latin American country, the export economy which began a sustained recovery under the Liberal Republic (briefly interrupted by the war with France). Hammett (2006) and Bazant (1985b) show that Mexico between 1855 and 1890 falls squarely within the pattern of **trade-led state formation**. For a nuanced interpretation of the entire trajectory of Mexican state formation see Knight (1992).

Mexico had never been described as a case where political parties contributed to national union. However, as increasingly supra-regional alliances, parties unintendedly provided the glue that no other bond—military, economic or cultural—supplied. Mexico is an archetype of **party-driven state formation**, which can be based on the multiple histories of Mexican political

⁶ Additional readings include Archer (2003), Anna (2004) and Guardino (1996), and Costeloe (1975).

parties, and of the Liberal party in particular: Bushnell and Macaulay (2004: ch. 9), Hale (2014), Ávila and Salmerón (2012), Perry (1978), Sinkin (1979), and Van Young (2021).

- Alamán, Lucas. 1849. *Historia de Méjico desde los primeros movimientos que prepararon su independencia en el año 1808 hasta la época presente*. Tomos I-IV. Madrid: J. M. Lara.
- Ávila, Alfredo, and Alicia Salmerón (eds.). 2012. *Partidos, Facciones y Otras Calamidades*. Mexico: Fondo de Cultura Económica.
- Anna, Timothy Edward. 2001. *Forging Mexico, 1821-1835*. Nebraska: University of Nebraska Press.
- Archer, Christon Ira (Ed.). 2003. *The Birth of Modern Mexico, 1780-1824*. New York: Rowman & Littlefield Publishers.
- Bazant, John. 1985a. "Mexico from Independence to 1867." In Leslie Bethell (ed.). *The Cambridge History of Latin America*, 3, New York: Cambridge University Press: 423-27.
- Bazant, John. 1985b. Mexico From Independence to 1867. In Leslie Bethell (ed.). *The Cambridge History of Latin America*, 3, New York: Cambridge University Press: 423-27.
- Bushnell, David, Macaulay, Neill. 1988. *The Emergence of Latin America in the Nineteenth Century*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Buve, Rafael. 1992. "Political Patronage and Politics at the Village Level in Central Mexico: Continuity and Change in Patterns from the Late Colonial Period to the End of the French Intervention (1867)." *Bulletin of Latin American Research*, 11.1: 1-28.
- Cline, Harris Francis. 1947. "The 'Aurora Yucateca' and the Spirit of Enterprise in Yucatan, 1821-1847." *The Hispanic American Historical Review*, 27.1.: 30-60.
- Cline, Harris Francis. 1948. The Henequen Episode in Yucatan. *Inter-American Economic Affairs*, 2.2: 30-51.
- Cline, Harris Francis. 1948. The Sugar Episode in Yucatan, 1825-1850. *Inter-American Economic Affairs*, 1.4: 79-100.
- Costeloe, Michael. 1975. *La Primera República Federal de México, 1824-1835: un Estudio de los Partidos Políticos en el México Independiente*. Mexico: Fondo de Cultura Económica.
- Díaz Díaz, Fernando. 1971. *Caudillos y Caciques: Antonio López de Santa Anna y Juan Álvarez*. Doctoral Dissertation. Mexico: El Colegio de México.
- González Navarro, Moisés. 1979. *La Guerra de Castas y el Henequén*. Centro de Estudios Históricos, Nueva Serie, 10.
- Guardino, Peter. 1996. *Peasants, Politics, and the Formation of Mexico's National State: Guerrero, 1800-1857*. Stanford: Stanford University Press.
- Guardino, Peter. 2017. *The Dead March: A History of the Mexican American War*. Boston: Harvard University Press.
- Hale, Charles Alain. 2014. *The Transformation of Liberalism in Late Nineteenth-century Mexico*. Princeton University Press.
- Hamnett, Bernard. 2019. *A Concise History of Mexico*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Harris, Charles Henry Alexander. 1975. *Mexican Family Empire: The Latifundio of the Sánchez Navarro Family, 1765-1867*. Austin: University of Texas Press.
- Joseph, Gilbert M. 1985. "From Caste War to Class War: The Historiography of Modern Yucatán (c. 1750-1940)." *Hispanic American Historical Review* 65.1: 111-134.
- Knight, Alan. 1992. "The Peculiarities of Mexican History: Mexico Compared to Latin America, 1821-1992." *Journal of Latin American Studies*, 24.1: 99-144.

- Lynch, John. 1992. *Caudillos in Spanish America, 1800-1850*. Oxford: Clarendon Press.
- Mora, José María Luis. 1836. *Méjico y sus Revoluciones (3 tomos)*. Paris: Librería de Rosa.
- Navarro, Moisés González. 1977. *Anatomía del Poder en México, 1848-1853*. Mexico: El Colegio de México.
- Palacio, Vicente Riva (ed.). 1970. *México a Través de los Siglos: Historia General y Completa del Desenvolvimiento Social, Político, Religioso, Militar, Artístico, Científico y Literario de México desde la Antigüedad más Remota Hasta la Época Actual*. Mexico: Editorial Cumbre.
- Perry, Laurens Ballard. 1978. *Juárez and Díaz: Machine Politics in Mexico*. Chicago: Northern Illinois University Press.
- Reed, Nelson Antrim. 2001. *The Caste War of Yucatan: Revised edition*. Stanford: Stanford University Press.
- Roniger, Leonardo. 1987. "Caciquismo and Colonelismo: Contextual Dimensions of Patron Brokerage in Mexico and Brazil." *Latin American Research Review*, 22.2: 71-99.
- Scholes, Walter Vinton. 1957. *Mexican Politics During the Juárez Regime, 1855-1872*. University of Missouri Press.
- Sinkin, Richard. 1979. *The Mexican Reform, 1855-1876: A Study in Liberal Nation-building*. Austin: University of Texas at Austin.
- Stevens, Donald Fithian. 1991. *Origins of Instability in Early Republican Mexico*. Durham: Duke University Press.
- Tenenbaum, Barbara A. 1986. *The Politics of Penury: Debt and Taxes in Mexico, 1821-1856*. Mexico: University of New Mexico.
- Van Young, Eric. 2021. *A Life Together: Lucas Alaman and Mexico, 1792-1853*. Yale University Press.
- Vázquez, Juan Javier. 1994. "De la Difícil Constitución de un Estado: México, 1821-1854." *Nueva Imagen*: 9-38.

Chapter 9

Party-Driven State Formation in Comparative Perspective

Colombia

This account of Colombian state-formation is compatible with, yet distinct from, the new canon of Colombian historiography (Jaramillo Uribe 1989; Tirado Mejía 1989), and current synthetic works of the entire history of Colombia (Bushnell 1993; Safford and Palacios 2002).

A key contribution of this chapter is to show that the territory of current Colombia was home to a **failed state** between 1830 to 1880, because of **territorial fragmentation** and the recurrence of **civil wars**. A key source for territorial fragmentation is Park (1985: esp. ch 1), González (1987), Gilmore (1995), and Uribe de Hincapié and Álvarez (1987). Colombian civil wars occurred first among regions. For the *Guerra de los Supremos* (1839-1842), a great summary is Prado Arellano (2005), and for the *Guerra por Las Soberanías* (1859-1862), Uribe de Hincapié and López Lopera (2008) select and analyze the full range of war reports. Around 1870s, parties replaced regions as the main contenders of Colombian civil wars. Key works for civil wars after 1875 are Posada-Carbó (1997), Deas (1993), and Mazzuca and Robinson (2009). Bergquist (1978) provides an economic interpretation of the partisan wars. For the fiscal side of state failure in Colombia state, see Deas (1982).

The chapter also shows that international trade, especially coffee exports, contributed to ending civil wars and unifying the country. The case for **trade-led state formation** in Colombia is based on Melo (1979), McGreevey (2015), Safford and Palacios (2002: ch. 12), and Kalmanovitz (2003). Chapter 9 in *LSF* further claims that Colombia followed a **party-driven** variant of trade-led state formation. The pathbreaking work by Safford (1972) and Delpar (1981) was followed by Safford and Palacios (2002: ch. 8) and Villegas Lozano (2015).

Uruguay

This account of Uruguayan state-formation is compatible with the standard versions of 19th century-Uruguayan history, but it provides a new perspective to read them in terms of trade-led, party-driven, state formation. Standard accounts include Ares Pons (1967), Zum Felde (1972), Barrán (1979), Oddone (1986), and Real de Azúa (1997)

A key contribution of this chapter is to show that Uruguay was a **failed state** between 1835 to 1895 because of the recurrence of **civil wars**, several rooted in **caudillo** rivalries. A good guide to Uruguayan civil wars is Peirano (2000/02). For *caudillismo*, Sala de Touron and Alonso Eloy (1986-1991) provide socioeconomic context, and Castellanos (1982), geopolitical context.

The chapter also shows that international trade, especially wool and beef exports, contributed to pacification and unification. The case for **trade-led state formation** in Uruguay is based on Barrán and Nahum (1967-78), Finch (1981), Millot and Bertino (1991-96). Winn (1972) illuminates the international, especially British, sources of export-led growth in Uruguay in the second half of the 19th century. The case for the **party-driven variant** of latecomer state formation in Uruguay is based on Pivel Devoto (1942; 1952), Reyes Abadie (1989), López-Alves (2000: ch. 2), Gallardo (2003), and Caetano (2016).

Primary Sources: all identified in the endnotes of the chapter.

Secondary Sources:

- Ares Pons, Roberto. 1967. *Uruguay: ¿Provincia o Nación?* Montevideo: Nuevo Mundo.
- Barrán, José Pedro. 1979. *Apogeo y Crisis del Uruguay Pastoril y Caudillesco: 1839–1875*. Montevideo: Ediciones de la Banda Oriental.
- Barrán, José Pedro, and Benjamín Nahum. 1967–78. *Historia Rural del Uruguay Moderno*. Montevideo: Banda Oriental.
- Bergquist, Charles Wylie. 1978. *Coffee and Conflict in Colombia, 1886–1910*, Durham: Duke University Press.
- Bushnell, David. 1993. *The Making of Modern Colombia: A Nation in Spite of Itself*. Berkeley: University of California Press.
- Caetano, Gerardo. 2016, “Genealogías de la Política Uruguaya Moderna: Disputas y Balances entre Liberalismo, Republicanismo y Democracia en el Siglo XIX,” *Claves: Revista de Historia*, 2.2: 111–43.
- Castellanos, Alfredo. 1982. *La Cisplatina, la Independencia y la República Caudillesca*. Montevideo: Ediciones de la Banda Oriental y La República.
- Deas, Malcolm. 1982. “The Fiscal Problems of Nineteenth-century Colombia.” *Journal of Latin American Studies* 14.2: 287–328.
- Deas, Malcolm. 1993. “Pobreza, Guerra Civil y Política,” in *Del Poder y la Gramática y Otros Ensayos Sobre Historia, Política, y Literatura Colombianas*. Bogotá: Tercer Mundo Editores: 121–73.
- Delpar, Helen. 1981. *Red Against Blue: the Liberal Party in Colombian Politics, 1863–1899*. Tuscaloosa: University of Alabama Press.
- Finch, Henry Martin. 1981. *A Political Economy of Uruguay since 1870*. New York: Saint Martin’s Press.
- Gallardo, Javier. 2003. “Las Ideas Republicanas en los Orígenes de la Democracia Uruguaya,” *Araucaria: Revista Iberoamericana de Filosofía, Política y Humanidades*, 9.1: 3–44.
- Gilmore, Robert Louis. 1995. *El Federalismo en Colombia, 1810–1858*. Bogotá: Universidad Externado de Colombia.
- González, Fernán. 1987. *Problemas Políticos y Regionales Durante los Gobiernos del Olimpo Radical*. Bogotá: CINEP.
- Jaramillo Uribe, Jaime (ed.). 1989. *Nueva Historia de Colombia: República*. Bogotá: Planeta.
- Jaramillo Uribe, Jaime, and Jorge Eliécer Ruiz. 1979. *Manual de historia de Colombia. Siglo XIX*. Colombia: Instituto Colombiano de Cultura.
- Kalmanovitz, Salomón. 2003. *Economía y Nación: Una Breve Historia de Colombia*. Bogotá: Editorial Norma.
- López-Alves, Fernando. 2000. *State Formation and Democracy in Latin America, 1810–1900*. Durham: Duke University Press.
- Mazzuca, Sebastián, and James A. Robinson. 2009. “Political conflict and power sharing in the origins of modern Colombia.” *Hispanic American Historical Review* 89.2: 285–321.
- McGreevey, William Paul. 2015. *Historia Económica de Colombia, 1845–1930*. Bogotá: Universidad de los Andes.
- Melo, Jorge Orlando. 1978. *Los Orígenes de los Partidos Políticos en Colombia*. Bogotá: Coacultura.
- Melo, Jorge Orlando. 1979. “La Evolución Económica de Colombia, 1830–1900.” In Jaramillo Uribe, Jaime (ed.). *Manual de historia de Colombia*, 2. Instituto Colombiano de Cultura: 133–207.

- Melo, Jorge Orlando. 1989. "De Carlos E. Restrepo a Marco Fidel Suárez: Republicanismo y Gobiernos Conservadores," in Álvaro Tirado Mejía (ed.). *Nueva Historia de Colombia: Historia Política, 1886-1946*. Bogotá: Planeta.
- Millot, Julio and Magdalena Bertino. 1991. *Historia Económica del Uruguay*. Montevideo: Fundación de Cultura Univesitaria.
- Oddone, Juan A. 1986. "The Formation of Modern Uruguay, c. 1870–1930." In Leslie Bethell (ed.). *The Cambridge History of Latin America*, 5, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Park, James Williams. 1985. *Rafael Nunez and the Politics of Colombian Regionalism, 1863-1886*. Baton rouge: Louisiana State University Press.
- Peirano, Ricardo (2000-02). *Gran Enciclopedia del Uruguay*. Barcelona: Sol 9.
- Pivel Devoto, Juan E. 1942. *Historia de los Partidos Políticos en el Uruguay*. Montevideo: Atlántida.
- Pivel Devoto, Juan E. 1952. *Historia de los Partidos y las Ideas Políticas en el Uruguay. La Definición de Bandos. 1829-1838*. Montevideo: Medina.
- Posada-Carbó, Eduardo. 1994, "Elections and Civil Wars in Nineteenth-century Colombia: The 1875 Presidential Campaign." *Journal of Latin American Studies*, 26.3: 621-649.
- Prado Arellano, Luis Ervin. 2005. "La Guerra de los Supremos (1839-1842)." *Cuestiones*: 9-27.
- Reyes Abadie, Washington. 1989. *Historia del Partido Nacional*. Montevideo: Banda Oriental.
- Real de Azúa, Carlos. 1997. *Historia y Política en el Uruguay*. Montevideo: Editorial Cal y Canto.
- Safford, Frank. 1972. "Social Aspects of Politics in Nineteenth-century Spanish America: New Granada, 1825-1850." *Journal of Social History*, 5.3: 344-370.
- Safford, Frank, and Marco Palacios. 2002. *Colombia: Fragmented Land, Divided Society*. New York: Oxford University Press, 2002.
- Sala de Touron, Lucía, and Rosa Alonso Eloy. 1986-91. *El Uruguay, Comercial, Pastoril y Caudillesco*. Montevideo: Banda Oriental.
- Tirado Mejía, Álvaro (ed.). 1989. *Nueva Historia de Colombia: Historia Política, 1886-1946*. Bogotá: Planeta.
- Uribe de Hincapié, María Teresa, and Liliana María López Lopera. 2008. *La Guerra por las Soberanías. Memorias y Relatos en la Guerra Civil de 1859-1862 en Colombia*. Medellín: Instituto de Estudios Políticos/La Carreta
- Uribe de Hincapié, María Teresa y Jesús María Álvarez. 1987. *Poderes y Regiones: Problemas en la Constitución de la Nación Colombiana, 1810-1850*. Medellín: Prensa de la Universidad de Antioquia.
- Villegas Lozano, Germán. 2015. "Historia de los Partidos Políticos en Colombia." *Via Inveniendi et Iudicandi*, 10.1: 11-42.
- Winn, Peter. 1976. "British Informal Empire in Uruguay in the Nineteenth Century." *Past & Present*, 73: 100-126.
- Zum Felde, Alberto. 1972. *Proceso Histórico del Uruguay*. Montevideo: Arca.